

**UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO**

**THE GOVERNING COUNCIL**

**DECEMBER 15, 2015**

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL held on December 15, 2015 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall.

**Present:**

Ms Judy G. Goldring (Chair)  
Ms Shirley Hoy (Vice Chair)  
The Honourable Michael H. Wilson (Chancellor)  
Professor Meric S. Gertler (President)  
Mr. Faizan Sohail Akbani  
Professor John S. Bland  
Mr. Harvey Botting  
Mr. David Norris Bowden  
Mr. Jeff Collins  
Mr. Gary D. Goldberg  
Professor Avrum I. Gotlieb  
Ms Zabeen Hirji  
Mr. Alex Iovic  
Mr. Brian K. Johnston  
Ms Claire M.C. Kennedy  
Mr. Ray Khan  
Professor Paul Kingston  
Mr. Mark Krembil  
Mr. Nykolaj Kuryluk  
Professor Ernest W.N. Lam  
Mr. Brian D. Lawson  
Ms Nancy Carolyn Lee  
Professor Jan Mahrt-Smith  
Dr. Gary P. Mooney  
Mr. John Paul Morgan  
Ms N. Jane Pepino  
Professor Cheryl Regehr  
Ms Catherine Riddell  
Mr. Mark Henry Rowswell  
Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak  
Mr. Howard L. Shearer

Professor Elizabeth M. Smyth  
Professor Salvatore M. Spadafora  
Mr. Andrew Szende  
Professor Nicholas Terpstra  
Mr. W. Keith Thomas  
Professor Steven J. Thorpe  
Mr. Bruce Winter  
Mr. Lawrence Zhang  
  
Mr. Louis R. Charpentier, Secretary of the  
Governing Council

**Secretariat:**

Ms Sheree Drummond  
Ms. Cindy Ferencz-Hammond  
Mr. Anwar Kazimi  
Mr. Patrick McNeill  
Ms Rena Parsan  
Ms Amorell Saunders N'Daw  
Mr. David Walders

**Absent:**

Mr. Preet Banerjee  
Mr. P.C. Choo  
Ms Janet L. Ecker  
Ms Susan Froom  
Professor Hugh P. Gunz  
Ms. Sandy Hudson  
Mr. Ridwan Olow  
Ms Melinda M. Rogers  
Mr. Riaz Sayani-Mulji  
Professor Janice Gross Stein

**In Attendance:**

Mr. Robert G. Boeckner, Member, Business Board & Audit Committee  
Professor Vivek Goel, Vice-President, Research and Innovation  
Professor Angela Hildyard, Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity  
Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations  
Professor Siobhan Nelson, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs  
Professor Sandy Welsh, Vice-Provost, Students  
Mr. Malcolm Lawrie, Assistance Vice-President, University Planning, Design & Construction

Ms Bryn MacPherson, Assistant Vice-President & Chief of Protocol, Office of the President  
Ms Gillian Morrison, Assistant Vice-President, Division of University Advancement  
Ms Marny Scully, Assistant Vice-President, Government, Institutional and Community Relations  
Mr. David Curtain, Director, Communications Services, Office of the President  
Mr. Rafael Eskenazi, Director, Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Office  
Mr. Paul Fraumeni, Executive Director, Digital Creative Services  
Ms Nora Gillespie, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the Vice-President and Provost  
Anthony Gray, Director, Strategic Research, Office of the President  
Dr. Anthony Gray, Director, Strategic Research, Office of the President  
Ms Nadina Jamison, Executive Director, Stakeholder Relations & Strategic Initiatives, Office of the President  
Ms Helen Lasthiotakis, Executive Director, Office of the Vice-President, Research & Innovation  
Mr. Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the President  
Ms Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost  
Ms Meredith Strong, Director, Office of the Vice-Provost, Students & Student Policy Advisor  
Ms Kimberly Yeh, Director, Office of the Vice-President, Government, Institutional and Community Relations  
Ms Martha Drake, University of Toronto Schools  
Ms Rosemary Evans, Principal, University of Toronto Schools  
Mr Jim Fleck, Chair, Board of Directors, University of Toronto Schools  
Ms Susan French, University of Toronto Schools  
Mr. John Duffy, University of Toronto Schools  
Mr. Anthony Scott, University Community Member

IN ACCORDANCE WITH A DETERMINATION BY THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, PURSUANT TO SECTIONS 28 (E) AND 38 OF BY-LAW NUMBER 2 OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL, ITEM 1 ON THE AGENDA WAS CONSIDERED BY THE GOVERNING COUNCIL *IN CAMERA*.

**The Committee moved *In Camera*.**

**1. (a.) Report Number 59 of the Committee for Honorary Degrees**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the recommendations contained in Report Number 59 of the Committee for

Honorary Degrees be approved; and

THAT the Chancellor and the President be empowered to determine the degree to be conferred on each candidate and the date of the conferral.

**(b.) Appointment of an Assistant Secretary to the Discipline Appeals Board**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT Ms Krista Osbourne be appointed Assistant Secretary of the Discipline Appeals Board, effective December 15, 2015.

**The Committee returned to Open Session.**

**2. Chair's Remarks**

The Chair welcomed members to the meeting. The Chair noted that the recent Council of Chairs of Ontario Universities (CCOU) Conference was well attended by UofT governors and had contained excellent information that was relevant to the post-secondary education sector.

She congratulated Professor Cheryl Regehr on being named by the Women's Executive Network (WXN) as one of Canada's Most Powerful Women – Top 100 – for her work in the public sector.

The Chair informed members that the following speaking requests had been received by the Secretariat:

- One was on agenda item 4a – The Three Priorities: A Discussion paper. This request had been granted.
- The second request concerned a matter not on the meeting agenda – fossil fuel divestment. The Chair advised members that in considering requests from individuals to address the Governing Council, the Executive Committee, which provides advice to the Chair, considered a number of factors. These included whether the items were on the Council's agenda. For matters not on the agenda, the Committee also considered whether the matter to be raised by the speaker related to work in which the administration was currently engaged and which was anticipated to result in a proposal to governance at a future date. The request was declined; however, the requester was invited to provide a written submission, which had been circulated to governors.

**3. Report of the President**

The Chair invited the President to make his report.

The President reported on his recent trip to China and said that it had been extraordinarily successful. He advised members that he had participated in UofT's Hong Kong graduation celebration with the Chancellor and 800 participants, including 180 students and their families. He also attended a gala dinner to celebrate the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the University of Toronto (Hong Kong) Foundation (which raises scholarship funds to support students from Hong Kong who require financial assistance to attend U of T). He noted that, at the invitation of Canada's Ambassador to China, he delivered a keynote address at the Canadian embassy in Beijing on the role of urban regions and universities in building future prosperity.

The China trip had also included an alumni reception in Shanghai, a recruitment event with principals of some of Shanghai's leading high schools, and meetings with key government officials, donors, and members of the Chinese business community. Professor Gertler noted that the trip had also provided an opportunity to meet with the leadership of some of China's top universities, including Peking University, Tsinghua University, Shanghai Jiao Tong University, and Fudan University, where the topic of expanding partnership opportunities was discussed.

The President provided an update on federal government relations noting that he had been in Ottawa for U15 (Canada's 15 research intensive universities) meetings during the first week of November. He commented on the fact that there were now two federal ministers with responsibilities for science within their remit: Mr. Navdeep Bains, Minister of Innovation, Science and Economic Development and Dr. Kirsty Duncan, Minister of Science, who was a U of T Alumna and part-time lecturer. The President highlighted that five ministers have strong connections to U of T, including Ms Catherine McKenna, who was appointed Minister of Environment and Climate Change, and had been a lecturer at the Munk School of Global Affairs. The President remarked that he believed that these appointments signalled an important appreciation for curiosity-driven research, the role of academics and evidence-based policy. The President reported that the affordability of higher education also appeared to be a government priority given planned improvements to the Canada Student Grant program and other initiatives. Other areas of interest appeared to be the entrepreneurship agenda, with particular attention to incubators, as well as cities and infrastructure, including attention to transportation, renewable energy, clean technology, social housing and other city building initiatives. He noted that these priorities, which had been reflected in the Speech from the Throne, bode well for the University.

On the provincial front, the President noted that the draft report from the funding formula review exercise had been released on December 10<sup>th</sup>. He said that Ms Suzanne Herbert, Executive Lead, University Funding Model Review, had offered some highlights of the review at a recent Council of Ontario Universities (COU) meeting. Some of the issues addressed in the draft report included using a strong outcomes lens to guide public funding of education and the possibility of expanding performance funding. There was an emphasis on the student experience, student success and the undergraduate mission. The President reported that the draft report was clear in indicating that the Province would use the strategic mandate agreements to guide further discussion on funding, advancing the Province's differentiation agenda to reflect each university's unique role in the post-secondary education system.

On the topic of international rankings, the President reported that according to the 2015 Global Employability University Ranking from *Times Higher Education*, the University of Toronto was one of the top ten universities in the world when it came to the employability of its graduates. The President noted that U of T was the highest-ranked university outside the US and the UK and among the top three public institutions in the world. The results were based on a survey of more than 2,200 recruiters from 21 countries. The President also pointed out that the University's ranking had continued to rise in recent years, testament to the success of the University's pedagogical approach that focuses not just on skills, but on competencies like creativity, critical thinking, analysis, and communications.

The President provided a brief update on the work of the *ad hoc* Advisory Committee tasked to bring forward recommendations to the President on the issue of divesting from fossil fuels. He reminded members that he had received a petition in March, 2014, asking the University to fully divest from direct investments in fossil fuel companies and that, under the *Policy on Social and Political Issues With Respect to University Divestment*, an *ad hoc* advisory committee had been struck.

The President advised that he had just received the Committee's Report and said that it would be posted online the next day (December 16). He explained that the next steps would include gathering further information and specialized advice, as appropriate. The University's response to the recommendations and broad strategy would then be discussed with the senior team before a decision was made and shared with the community. The President said that the Report was considered, nuanced, and thoughtful and he thanked the members of the Committee for their extraordinary efforts.

The President concluded his report by reflecting on the violent events in Paris, France and in San Bernadino, California, effects of which were felt widely, including on our campuses. He said that the occasion called for the need to remind ourselves of the University's role and values, including diversity, inclusion and outstanding scholarship, which both encouraged and required the free exchange of ideas and perspectives. He said that while fear and intolerance were becoming widespread in many corners of the world and while there were challenges here at home, the compassion, kinship, understanding, and professionalism of the U of T community continued to inspire him.

The Chair invited questions from members.

A member inquired whether the *ad hoc* Advisory Committee's Report had made a recommendation for or against divestment. The President replied that given the nuances and complexity of the matter he would encourage the member to read the Report once it became available online.

In response to a question as to whether faculty exchanges had been discussed with university leaders during the President's China trip, President Gertler replied that faculty and student exchanges, including joint research projects, had been discussed.

#### **4. Items for Governing Council Approval**

##### ***a. Three Priorities: A Discussion Paper***

The Chair introduced the item by noting the significance of the moment. She told Governing Council members that they were being asked to deliberate and endorse the vision for the University as laid out by the President. The Chair said that there had been a considerable amount of conversation and debate of the priorities within the University community and at numerous governance bodies. She mentioned that at the Executive Committee meeting on December 7<sup>th</sup>, the Committee had a full discussion of the matter and had endorsed it for consideration at Governing Council. She then invited the President to provide a brief overview of the *Three Priorities* to governors.

The President noted that over the past year, he had presented his *Three Priorities* at 25 sessions attended by more than 2,000 participants and that he had received positive, constructive feedback, and overwhelming agreement in principle. The *Three Priorities* initiative had been designed as a means to achieve the goals set out in *Towards 2030* planning document, enhancing the University's standing as:

- a leader in research-intensive undergraduate education;
- a leader in graduate education;
- a globally ranked research powerhouse.

The President described his three priorities:

1. Leverage our urban location(s) more fully, for the mutual benefit of University and city;
2. Strengthen and deepen key international partnerships by means of a well-defined strategic focus;
3. Re-imagine or reinvent undergraduate education.

Professor Gertler's presentation included the following key points:

- The University seeks to take better advantage of its location in one of the world's most vibrant, culturally diverse and economically dynamic regions, for the benefit of both the University and the residents of the Greater Toronto Area.
- The University seeks to improve the state of our host city-region and to enhance its reputation as a city builder by strengthening relationships, expanding outreach and partnerships and developing global fluency among students.
- Two new part-time positions had been created: a Presidential Advisor on Urban Engagement and a Special Advisor to the President, Urban Issues; both would work in close partnership with the President to advance the University's reputation as a community partner and city builder.
- The University seeks to enhance its ability to meet global challenges, to enhance its global reputation, profile and rankings while enhancing its success in attracting and retaining talent. In augmenting the global fluency of students, the number and range of international experiences should be expanded.
- It was noted that work had already been underway in developing strategies to expand the number of opportunities for students; work was also underway on developing country-specific strategies.
- A new academic advisory committee on international initiatives had been created and was chaired by Professor Janice Stein, Senior Presidential Advisor on International Initiatives and founding Director of the Munk School of Global Affairs.
- The University would seek ways to re-imagine or re-invent undergraduate education at a research-intensive university, taking advantage of emerging opportunities, including new pedagogical technologies.
- The University would seek ways to continue and expand its efforts in preparing students for lifelong success. There would be a focus on rejuvenating the liberal education model and to anticipate, leverage and create disruptive changes in modes/mechanisms for education and knowledge production.
- The University plans to promote transition initiatives, entrepreneurship opportunities, co-op programs, work placements and the broader use of the co-curricular record. This may also involve developing opportunities for our community, including alumni, to mentor.
- The appointments of Professor Susan McCahan as Vice-Provost, Innovations in Undergraduate Education and Professor Vivek Goel as Vice-President, Research and Innovation would provide additional leadership in fulfilling the University's mission.

In concluding his presentation, the President highlighted that the three priorities were mutually reinforcing and interconnected, and that both urban and international partnerships had the potential to enhance and reinvent undergraduate education.

The Chair invited Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak to report on the discussion that had occurred at the meeting of the Academic Board on November 19, 2015. She reported that the Academic Board discussion included opportunities for divisions to look for ways to imbed and incorporate opportunities such as research, study abroad, or experiential learning within their specific degree or program requirements. She indicated that there had been a growth of such programs within some divisions while others had indicated a commitment towards creating such opportunities. It had also been suggested that course descriptions could be tagged in order to enable students to easily identify innovative learning opportunities.

Professor Sass-Kortsak highlighted that the University remained a “living laboratory” for innovations to enhance the quality of life in the Greater Toronto Area (GTA) and beyond and noted that the University had joined forces with York University, Ryerson University, and OCAD University to conduct a transportation survey whose data would be shared with appropriate planning agencies in an effort to better serve students in the GTA. She also mentioned that the recent overhaul of the University of Toronto’s communications infrastructure would help provide a more effective and compelling narrative to neighbouring communities about the University’s many positive contributions to the GTA and beyond.

The Chair invited questions.

One member asked about the 100 series courses and whether there were plans to study the effectiveness of different curricula and different pedagogical tools. In response, President Gertler noted that such studies and other innovative ideas were already under way. He commented that the University of Toronto was already a leader in the study and evaluation of technology-assisted learning tools, including inverted classrooms and MOOCs (massive open online courses).

A member asked whether a reporting mechanism was being developed to keep the Governing Council apprised on the progress on the President’s priorities. President Gertler assured members that he would report on progress at least annually and that, when speaking to specific initiatives, he would refer back to the three priorities. He also noted that he was pleased to see individual divisions across the University embracing the priorities and embedding them within their academic plans.

The Chair invited Mr. Anthony Scott, whose speaking request had been granted, to make his remarks.

Mr. Scott thanked the Chair for the opportunity to address the Council and stated that, in his view, the administration would not be capable of carrying out the priorities. He pointed to the *Varsity* article on mental health as an example of an issue which had been inadequately addressed by the administration. Mr. Scott also expressed concern about the University’s real estate ventures, which he characterized as risky, and its labour practices, which he felt were unfair.

There were no further questions or comments from members.

On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the *Three Priorities: Summary Framework - Strategic Priorities: Leveraging Our Location(s), Strengthening International Partnerships, and Rethinking Undergraduate Education*, contained within *Three Priorities: A Discussion Paper*, be endorsed in principle.

The Chair congratulated the President and his team and said that the Governing Council looked forward to seeing how the priorities unfolded and took shape in the coming years.

***b. Revised Affiliation Agreement and ancillary agreements between the Governing Council of the University of Toronto and the University of Toronto Schools (UTS)***

The Chair invited the President to introduce the item. President Gertler stated that the Revised Affiliation Agreement and ancillary agreements between the Governing Council and the University of Toronto Schools was part of the process of re-engagement with UTS and were the result of formal discussions.

Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President of Operations, was invited to comment on the Agreement. He mentioned that the University and UTS had been in discussions for four years. Some of the highlights of the agreements included: that UTS would assume the cost of maintaining the heritage site while the building would continue to be owned by the University, that U of T would have to approve any changes to the building and that UTS would be expected to comply with U of T building standards. Professor Mabury said that the project solidified the relationship between the two institutions and would further strengthen the academic connection. The Affiliation Agreement was expected to be in place for 50 years and was broader and deeper than it had historically been which he said bode well for the future.

The Chair invited Professor Sass-Kortsak, Chair of Academic Board, to provide an overview of the discussion that occurred at the Board. Professor Sass-Kortsak remarked that a member of the Board had noted that the Affiliation Agreement provided a stellar example of the successful urban outreach efforts of the University and its connection to its surrounding community.

The Chair of Business Board was also invited to provide an overview of that Board's discussion. Ms Jane Pepino reported that there was a very thorough discussion of the Revised Affiliation Agreement and the mutually beneficial nature of the relationship between UTS and the University. Ms Pepino noted that she had explained to the Board the benefits for students enrolled in the Masters programs at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE) and how these students enhanced the student experience for UTS students and benefited from the teaching experience at UTS. She said that the Business Board expressed enthusiastic support for the Revised Agreement.

A member commented on the withdrawal of the University's financial support for UTS in 2006 that had led to the previous Affiliation Agreement and asked what was different about the current situation. Professor Mabury explained that the academic links between UTS and the University have been strengthened in the last several years and that this had had a mutually beneficial impact on both institutions. Similarly, over this period, UTS has operationally become more financially stable. He believed that the partnership between UTS and the University was much stronger and more viable as a result.

On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED

- i. THAT the revised *Affiliation Agreement between the Governing Council of the University of Toronto and the University of Toronto Schools (UTS)* dated December 16, 2015 be approved; and
- ii. THAT the Vice-President, University Operations be given authority to execute the *Revised Affiliation Agreement between the Governing Council of the University of Toronto and the University of Toronto Schools (UTS)* dated December 16, 2015.

The Chair invited representatives from UTS to comment.

Mr. Jim Fleck, Chair of the Board of Directors of UTS, thanked the Governing Council for its vote of confidence. He said that the School was pleased to have a 50-year agreement with the University and that it looked forward to contributing to the University's vision.

## **CONSENT AGENDA**

On a motion duly made, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the consent agenda be adopted and that the item requiring approval be approved.

### **5. Minutes of the Previous Meeting of the Governing Council**

The minutes of the October 29, 2015 meeting were approved.

### **6. Business Arising from the Previous Meeting**

There was no business arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

### **7. Reports for Information**

Members received the following reports for information:

- a) Report Number 200 of the Academic Board (November 19, 2015)
- b) Report Number 222 of the Business Board (November 2, 2015)
- c) Report Number 191 of the University Affairs Board (November 23, 2015)
- d) Report Number 14 of the University of Toronto Mississauga Campus Council (December 3, 2015)
- e) Report Number 14 of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council (October 14, 2015)
- f) Report Number 477 of the Executive Committee (December 7, 2105)

## **8. Date of Next Meeting**

The Chair advised members that the next Governing Council meeting was scheduled for Thursday, February 25, 2016 from 4:30 p.m. – 6:30 p.m.

## **9. Question Period**

There were no questions.

## **10. Other Business**

The Chair took the opportunity to note for the record the retirement of Mr. Louis Charpentier from the role of Secretary of Governing Council. She reiterated the Governing Council's immense appreciation for his contributions to the University in governance and in other roles at the University. She noted that Mr. Charpentier had served for 16 years as Secretary of the Governing Council, commenting that he had brought his immense knowledge of the institution, of governance, and of leadership in general to every aspect of his role. He was lauded as a disciplined, hardworking, efficient and discreet leader. Over his tenure, he had been a sage advisor to six Chairs of the Governing Council and to five Presidents. The Chair, noting the time and effort the role involved, commented that Mr. Charpentier had worked exceedingly hard over the many years. He had been a committed and dedicated leader, overseeing the many aspects of Governing Council and its evolution. She pointed to his impact including his extensive involvement in governance reform initiatives under the Task Force on Governance, his instrumental role in steering its many recommendations through governance and into practice, in particular the tri-campus reforms and the amendments to the Election Guidelines. The Chair acknowledged that Mr. Charpentier had executed his role with grace, elegance and a good sense of humour and that he had earned the deep respect, affection and gratitude of governors. She concluded by saying that it had been a privilege and honour to work with him and that he would be deeply missed. In closing, she thanked him for all that he had contributed.

The Chair then invited President Gertler to make some comments.

President Gertler remarked on three aspects of Mr. Charpentier's contributions: his commitment to excellence in all aspects of governance and his active involvement in shaping the University's current governance structure; his enduring belief in the University's cause and in upholding our reputation as a truly great university; and his humanity, noting that he was a deeply caring person from whom many had learned a tremendous amount. The President thanked Mr. Charpentier for his remarkable support and advice, particularly since assuming the role of President.

The Chair then called on the Vice-Chair, Ms Shirley Hoy, to comment. Ms Hoy remarked that Mr. Charpentier had served governors well through his strong leadership and his truly amazing ability to provide sage advice to all involved in governance. She said that he had always been thoughtful, thorough and timely in his advice and follow-up action. She acknowledges his profound understanding of governance and his ability to operationalize governance from a principled approach. She concluded by saying that it had been an honour and privilege to work with Mr. Charpentier and that she wished him well.

Mr. Charpentier said that it had been a remarkable privilege to serve the Governing Council and the University of Toronto, and he thanked the Chair, the President and the Vice-Chair for their kind words.

The meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

---

Secretary

---

Chair

January 12, 2016