

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

THE GOVERNING COUNCIL

OCTOBER 27, 2016

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL held on Thursday, October 27, 2016 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall.

Present:

Ms Shirley Hoy (Chair)
Ms Jane Pepino (Vice-Chair)
Professor Meric S. Gertler (President)
Mr. Mohammad Amin
Mr. Preet Banerjee
Mr. Harvey Botting
Dr. Catherine Bragg
Mr. P.C. Choo
Mr. Aidan H. Fishman
Ms Susan Froom
Mr. Gary D. Goldberg
Dr. Avrum I. Gotlieb
Professor Hugh P. Gunz
Mrs. Zabeen Hirji
Mr. Brian K. Johnston
Ms Claire M.C. Kennedy
Prof. Bruce Kidd
Professor Paul Kingston
Mr. Mark Krembil
Mr. Nykolaj Kuryluk
Professor Ernest W.N. Lam
Prof. Mark Lautens
Mr. Brian D. Lawson
Professor Jan K. Mahrt-Smith
Ms. Christine Moon
Mr. David Alex I. Nyikos
Ms Catherine Riddell
Mr. Mark Henry Rowswell
Mr. Igor Samardzic

Professor Andrea M. Sass-Kortsak
Mr. Bingchen (Tony) Shan
Professor Salvatore M. Spadafora
Mr. John Switzer
Mr. Andrew Szende
Professor Nicholas Terpstra
Mr. W. Keith Thomas
Professor Steven J. Thorpe
Mr. Bruce Winter
Ms. Samra Zafar

Ms. Sheree Drummond, Secretary of the
Governing Council

Secretariat:

Ms Amorell Saunders N'Daw
Ms Mae-Yu Tan

Absent:

Mr. David N. Bowden
Mr. Jeff P. Collins
Ms Janet L. Ecker
Mr. Jorge May
Mr. John Paul Morgan
Professor Cheryl Regehr
Ms Melinda M. Rogers
Mr. Howard L. Shearer
Professor Elizabeth M. Smyth
Professor Janice Gross Stein

In Attendance:

Professor Emeritus Ellen Hodnett, University Ombudsperson
Mr. David Estok, Vice-President, Communications
Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations
Mr. David Palmer, Vice-President, Advancement
Ms Barbara Dick, Assistant Vice-President, Alumni Relations, Division of University Advancement
Ms Gillian Morrison, Assistant Vice-President, Divisional Relations & Campaigns, Division of University Advancement
Professor Susan McCahan, Vice-Provost, Innovations in Undergraduate Education

Professor Siobhan Nelson, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs and Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Life

Professor Sandy Welsh, Vice-Provost Students

Professor Trevor Young, Vice-Provost, Relations with Health Care Institutions and Dean of Medicine

Mr. Robert G. Boeckner, Member, Business Board

Mr. Tad Brown, Counsel, Business Affairs and Advancement

Ms Taleen Chouljian, Member, College of Electors

Mr. David Curtin, Director, Communications Services, Office of the President

Dr. Tony Gray, Director, Strategic Research, Office of the President

Ms Nadina Jamison, Executive Director, Stakeholder Relations and Strategic Initiatives, Office of the President

Mr. Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the President

Ms Marny Scully, Deputy Chief, Government Relations

Ms Meredith Strong, Director, Office of the Vice-Provost, Students

Ms Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost

IN ACCORDANCE WITH A DETERMINATION BY THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF BY-LAW NUMBER 2 OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL, ITEM 12 ON THE AGENDA WAS CONSIDERED BY THE GOVERNING COUNCIL *IN CAMERA*.

1. Chair's Remarks

The Chair welcomed members. She reported that the Executive Committee, at its meeting held on October 19, 2016, had approved the following:

- The change in the position of Vice-Provost, Institutional Initiatives to Associate Vice-President & Vice-Provost, International Student Experience, with a dual reporting role to the Vice-President and Provost and to the Vice-President, International. The appointment of Professor Joseph Wong to the position for a four-year term, beginning January 1, 2017.
- The creation of the position of Associate Vice-President and Vice Provost, Digital Strategies in the Office of the Vice-President, University Operations, reporting jointly to the Vice-President and Provost.
- The change in the position of Associate Vice-President, Global Research Partnerships, to Associate Vice-President, International Partnerships, with a dual reporting relationship to the Vice-President, Research & Innovation and Vice-President, International.

The Chair also reported that Mr. Igor Samardzic was the successful candidate in the recent by-election that was held to fill a vacancy on the Governing Council in the part-time undergraduate student constituency. She congratulated and welcomed Mr. Samardzic. His term would be ending on June 30, 2017.

2. Report of the President

The Chair invited President Gertler to give his report. The President began by welcoming everyone to the first regular cycle meeting of the Governing Council for 2016-2017 governance year and he thanked members for their service to the institution.

(a) Rankings

The President commented on the most recent university rankings results. The President remarked that the University was ranked first in Canada in almost every ranking by a substantial margin. Some of the rankings highlighted by the President included:

- *Times Higher Education* – 22nd, 9th among public universities; 1st in Canada
- *QS World Rankings* – 32nd
- *National Taiwan University Rankings* – 4th
- *US News and World Report* – 21st
- *Maclean's* – 2nd

The President noted that despite different methodological approaches, there continued to be consistency and stability in the results, especially in academic disciplines and fields. He commented that the results were a tremendous boost for the University. It was all the more remarkable that the University's sustained excellence had been achieved in a climate of fiscal difficulties especially when our institution had the lowest funding for higher education as compared to other highly-ranked institutions. President Gertler remarked that while he was pleased with the rankings, the rise of educational institutions around the world and the increasingly competitive marketplace were matters that raised questions about the level of support for higher education among the various levels of government.

(b) Provincial Matters

President Gertler reported that Premier Kathleen Wynne's Business Advisor, Mr. Ed Clark, had recently made a speech at the Canadian Club of Toronto where he outlined key themes, including support for Ontario's knowledge economy and the need to develop talent to support the economic growth. Mr. Clark had also highlighted the role of cities in creating the right environment for companies to locate their operations to areas where there was an abundant supply of talent and ideas. To illustrate this point, Mr. Clark had used, as an example, the new Thomson Reuters Toronto Technology Centre and its plan to create 1,500 jobs. President Gertler noted that no taxpayer dollars had been used to facilitate the Thomson Reuters' expansion of its Canadian headquarters and that the company had been attracted by the talent pool from institutions like the University of Toronto and by the assurances of Canada's immigration framework which was conducive to bringing highly talented individuals from around the world. The President remarked that the announcement was very good news for the University and that it had served to demonstrate the value of being among the best in the world in many different fields.

President Gertler also reported that the work on revising the provincial funding formula for education was drawing to a conclusion and that it was anticipated that recommendations would be brought forward to Cabinet by the end of the year. The University administration continued to work closely with officials from the Ministry of Advanced Education and Skills Development (AESD) to inform the Ministry's work. He mentioned that the revisions to the formula would be good news for the University as there would be room to support differentiation as well as providing more funding tied to performance.

(c) Federal Matters

The President noted that the Post-Secondary Institutions Strategic Investment Fund (SIF) had committed \$2 billion for infrastructure programs and that the University had hosted the first announcement in July 2016, and that more announcements were awaited. The University had hosted Federal ministers, Navdeep Bains and Kirsty Duncan and Provincial ministers Deb Matthews and Reza Moridi at that announcement in July. The University had received almost \$98 million from the Federal and Provincial governments towards the \$190 million project to modernize and upgrade nearly half of its research laboratories over the next two years. Work on upgrading and renovating the facilities was well under way.

The President also noted that the Advisory Council on Economic Growth, chaired by Mr. Dominic Barton, would be releasing its recommendations through a series of reports. Some of the Council's recommendations would address the creation of an infrastructure bank, foreign direct investment in Canada and increased immigration. In speeches to the Toronto Board of Trade and the University's School of Public Policy and Governance, Mr. Barton had addressed the need to make strategic choices and the importance of talent, which President Gertler said were great themes for the University.

President Gertler also informed members on the work of the independent panel struck to review federal funding for fundamental science. The panel, chaired by President Emeritus David Naylor, was expected to complete its work by the end of the year.

(d) Update on Divestment

The President provided an update on divestment and mentioned that a call for nominations for the Committee on the Environment, Climate Change and Sustainability had been issued on October 21, 2016 and that suggestions had already been submitted, indicating a high level of interest. He reported that the University of Toronto Asset Management (UTAM) had been busy implementing the recommendations that had arisen from his response to the Presidential Advisory Committee on Divestment from Fossil Fuels, which had been released in March 2016. He noted that in June 2016, the University's Pension Committee had approved a revised Statement of Investment Policies and Procedures (SIPP) that had incorporated environmental, social and governance (ESG) factors into its language. It was expected that this would be integrated into investment analysis and management of the plan's assets. In September 2016, UTAM had engaged Institutional Shareholder Services (ISS), a proxy advisory firm, to provide proxy voting services where UTAM had direct share holdings as well as to support resolutions that reduced risk associated with ESG factors in its investment decision-making. In October 2016, UTAM had joined the Canadian-based Responsible Investment Association. President Gertler affirmed that UTAM was committed to signing and adopting the United Nations' Principles for Responsible Investment (UNPRI) by the end of 2016 and that it was working on how and when to fulfill its annual reporting requirement on these activities.

(e) Other Matters

The President concluded his report by commenting on recent controversial events. He noted that the University had experienced a number of anti-Semitic vandalism on or near the St. George campus and that these deplorable acts were deeply hurtful to the entire University community. The University had issued a statement condemning anti-Semitic vandalism and other forms of racism. The President also commented on the ongoing debate over free speech, diversity and inclusion related to recent events on the University campuses. President Gertler directed governors to the University's *Statement on Free Expression* (<http://www.president.utoronto.ca/statement-on-free-expression>). He reaffirmed the University's longstanding commitment to academic freedom and freedom of expression and remarked that such rights also brought responsibilities to ensure that students and faculty were able to work and

study in an environment free from harassment. He noted that members of the community were obliged to abide by these laws, unless and until the laws were changed. He reinforced that the University's mission was to encourage full, civil discussion on issues and to encourage engagement. He noted that the University remained mindful of the impact of these events on certain members of the Community and said that the institution was making sure that there were adequate support services in place.

In response to a question regarding the University's position with respect to the Maclean's university rankings, the President explained that the University had cooperated in providing information to that publication. Ms Marny Scully, Deputy Chief, Government Relations, added that a Common University Data Ontario (CUDO) data set for the University of Toronto was provided to Maclean's and that the Maclean's rankings had normalized for size, which, in turn, had had an impact on rankings results for the University.

3. *Report of the University Ombudsperson for the Period July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2016 and Administrative Response.*

The Chair welcomed Professor Emeritus Ellen Hodnett, University Ombudsperson to present her report. The Chair reminded governors that the University Ombudsperson was responsible to the Governing Council, through its Chair.

The Ombudsperson remarked that the University would be best served with early and regular communication to address systemic issues, since recommendations took time to be implemented. She noted that the administrative response demonstrated that progress had been made and she thanked Vice-Provost, Students, Professor Sandy Welsh and Vice-Provost, Academic Programs and Faculty and Academic Life, Professor Siobhan Nelson, for their work. Professor Emeritus Hodnett noted that no recommendation arose from isolated complaints to her Office and that further improvements for communication flow between the Ombudsperson's Office, administration and governance would be a positive for the University.

The Chair invited Professor Nelson to make comments on behalf of the Vice-President and Provost. Professor Nelson thanked the Ombudsperson for her service, her first annual report, and her focus on the tri-campus role. Professor Nelson highlighted one of the areas that the University had already been engaged in; accessibility and accommodations for students with mental health needs. She reported that work was being done to educate the community on policies and guidelines with respect to this issue.

In response to a question from a member regarding the rationale for focusing on accommodation and accessibility for mental health issues, Professor Emeritus Hodnett reported that it was a qualitative issue and that there were challenges in illustrating the scope and complexity of the same through data. She reported that the qualitative part addressed the complexity of the issue and that there were academic departments that needed help in addressing mental health issues for students. Professor Welsh also noted that there had been much discussion on the issue during the past year, particularly because of the settlement reached between a York University student and the Ontario Human Rights Commission.

A question was raised about the administrative response and other areas for improvement and Professor Emeritus Hodnett responded that she was very satisfied with the collaborative efforts over the past year.

A member suggested that administration provide an annual update on the recommendations that had been agreed to but not yet implemented in order to track progress. President Gertler thanked the member for the suggestion and said that it would be discussed with the senior team. He noted that many of the recommendations were systemic in nature and spoke to processes and practices that would take time and

that required consultation. The Ombudsperson added that it was an iterative process, noting that circumstances changed and more communication would enhance accountability.

4. Items for Governing Council Approval

a. Renewal of Affiliation Agreements between the University of Toronto and the Toronto Academic Health Science Network (TAHSN)

Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak reported that the existing agreement template between the University of Toronto and the fully affiliated Toronto Academic Health Science Network (TAHSN) hospitals had been previously approved by the Governing Council in 2011 and that the proposed changes would enable current processes to be updated. At the October 6, 2016 meeting of the Academic Board, Professor Trevor Young, Vice-Provost, Relations with Health Care Institutions; and Dean, Faculty of Medicine had spoken to the proposed changes and in response to a question regarding insurance coverage for the University's students on placements, he had assured the Academic Board that all the University's students working in the hospitals would be insured. Professor Young had also confirmed that full-time clinical faculty in fully affiliated hospitals were University-appointed faculty members.

On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

- (a) THAT the revised template for full affiliation agreements between the University of Toronto and the full member hospitals of the Toronto Academic Health Science Network be approved, effective immediately;
- (b) THAT the President, or designate, be authorized to sign such agreements on behalf of the Governing Council, provided that the agreements conform to the approved template; and
- (c) THAT the agreements signed under the provisions of this resolution be filed with the Secretary of Governing Council.

b. Revision of 2016-17 Domestic Tuition Fee for the Master of Financial Risk Management Program – Rotman School of Management: and transfer of fee from self-funded tuition fee schedule to publicly-funded tuition fee schedule

Ms Kennedy reported that at the Business Board meeting of September 22, 2016 the Executive Director, Planning and Budget, Ms Sally Garner, had advised the Board that the Ministry of Advanced Education and Skills Development had recently approved the *Master of Financial Risk Management* program as a publicly-supported program. When the tuition fees for this program had been approved in the spring, it was done on the basis of a self-funded program as government approval had not been received at that time. The amount had been an estimate of what it would cost the University to deliver the program. Government approval as a publicly-supported program has since resulted in a reduction of the program's tuition fee.

On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the 2016-17 domestic tuition fee for the Master of Financial Risk Management be approved at \$41,180.

5. Item for Information

Amendment to the *Policy with Respect to Workplace Harassment* (dated May 13, 2010)

The Chair informed members that the item had been first presented to the Business Board, which had responsibility over the occupational health and safety of University staff members as well as other health and safety policies. Ms Kennedy reported that then Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity, Professor Angela Hildyard, had advised the Board that the *Policy with Respect to Workplace Harassment*, which had originally been approved in 2010, had been updated to reflect legislated amendments that took effect on September 8, 2016. Under the *Sexual Violence and Harassment Action Plan Act, 2016*, the definition of “workplace harassment” was modified to include “workplace sexual harassment.” The amendments to the University’s *Policy* brought the University into compliance with the *Act* within the legislated timeline.

CONSENT AGENDA

On a motion duly made, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the consent agenda be adopted and that the item for approval be approved.

6. Minutes of the Previous Meeting of the Governing Council

The minutes of the September 8, 2016 meeting were approved.

7. Business Arising from the Report of the Previous Meeting

There was no business arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

8. Reports for Information

Members received the following reports for information:

- a. Report Number 205 of the Academic Board (October 6, 2016)
- b. Report Number 228 of the Business Board (September 22, 2016)
- c. Report Number 196 of the University Affairs Board (October 5, 2016)

- d. Report Number 19 of the University of Toronto Mississauga Campus Council (October 6, 2016)
- e. Report Number 20 of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council (October 5, 2016)
- f. Report Number 484 of the Executive Committee (October 19, 2016)

9. Date of Next Meeting

The Chair advised members that the next Governing Council meeting was scheduled for December 15, 2016 from 4:30 p.m. – 6:30 p.m.

END OF CONSENT AGENDA

10. Question Period

There were no questions.

11. Other Business

No other business was raised.

The Committee moved *In Camera*.

12. Campaign Update

Governors received an update on the Boundless Campaign from Mr. David Palmer, Vice-President, Advancement.

The Governing Council returned to Open Session.

The meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

Secretary

Chair

October 28, 2016