

**UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO**

**THE GOVERNING COUNCIL**

**OCTOBER 26, 2017**

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL held on October 26, 2017 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall.

**Present:**

Claire Kennedy (Chair)  
N. Jane Pepino (Vice-Chair)  
Meric S. Gertler (President)  
Cheryl Regehr (Provost)  
Harvey Botting  
Catherine Bragg  
P.C. Choo  
Jeff P. Collins  
Janet L. Ecker  
Aidan H. Fishman  
Susan Froom  
Gary D. Goldberg  
Avrum I. Gotlieb  
Amanda Harvey-Sanchez  
Zabeen Hirji  
Bruce Kidd  
Mark Krembil  
Nykolaj Kuryluk  
Normand Labrie  
Ernest W.N. Lam  
Mark Lautens  
Jan K. Mahrt-Smith  
Mohan Matthen  
John Paul Morgan  
Mama Adobea Nii Owoo  
Catherine Riddell  
Andrea M. Sass-Kortsak  
Howard L. Shearer  
Salvatore M. Spadafora  
Janice Gross Stein  
Andrew Szende

W. Keith Thomas  
Steven J. Thorpe  
Twesh Upadhyaya  
Bruce Winter  
Robert Xu  
Emeli (Li) Zhang

Sheree Drummond, Secretary of the Governing Council

**Secretariat:**

Mariam Ali  
Cindy Ferencz-Hammond  
Joan Griffin  
Anwar Kazimi  
Patrick McNeill  
Rena Prashad  
David Walders

**Absent:**

Preet Banerjee  
David N. Bowden  
Shirley Hoy  
Mala Kashyap  
Paul Kingston  
Brian D. Lawson  
Mark Henry Rowsell  
John Switzer  
Nicholas Terpstra  
Samra Zafar

**In Attendance:**

Ellen Hodnett, University Ombudsperson  
Vivek Goel, Vice-President, Research and Innovation  
Ulrich Krull, Interim Vice-President, University of Toronto and Principal, University of Toronto Mississauga  
Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations and Vice-Provost, Academic Operations  
David Palmer, Vice President, Advancement  
Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost

Nadina Jamison, Assistant Vice-President, Strategic Initiatives, Office of the President  
Bryn MacPherson, Assistant Vice President & Chief of Protocol, Office of the President  
Gillian Morrison, Assistant Vice-President, Divisional Relations & Campaigns, Division of University Advancement  
Sioban Nelson, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs and Vice-Provost, Faculty & Academic Life  
Sandy Welsh, Vice-Provost Students

Cristina Amon, Dean, Faculty of Applied Science and Engineering  
Wendy Duff, Dean, Faculty of Information  
Rafeal Eskanazi, Director, Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Office  
Althea Blackburn-Evans, Director, News and Media Relations  
Gwen Burrows, Executive Director, Office of the Vice-President International  
Elizabeth Cragg, Director, Office of the Vice-President, University Operations  
Gilbert Delgado, Chief of University Planning, Design and Construction  
Nora Gillespie, Legal Counsel, Offices of the VP & Provost & to the VP, HR & Equity  
Sara Gottlieb, Assistant Dean and Counsel, Faculty of Medicine  
Tony Gray, Director, Strategic Research, Office of the President  
Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the President  
Julie McAlpine-Jefferies, Senior Legal Counsel, Labour and Employment  
Terry McQuaid, Executive Director, Personal Safety, High Risk and Sexual Violence Prevention and Support  
Susan Senese, Interim Chief Executive Officer, UTM

Robert Adranga, aUToronto  
Keenan Burnett, Presenter and Team Lead, aUToronto  
Nathan Chan, Associate President, UTSU  
Adam El-Masri, aUToronto  
Robert G. Boeckner, Member, Business Board  
Brie Berry-Crossfield, Finance and University Governance Commissioner for the Graduate Students' Union  
Geoffrey Hinton, University Professor Emeritus, Chief Scientific Advisor, Vector Institute  
Stewart Jamieson, aUToronto  
Kevin Jen, aUToronto  
Frank Lai, aUToronto  
Winston Liu, aUToronto  
Mathias Memmel, President, UTSU  
Jacob Nazarenko, aUToronto  
Angella Schoellig, Presenter and Principal Faculty Advisor, aUToronto

IN ACCORDANCE WITH A DETERMINATION BY THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF BY-LAW NUMBER 2 OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL, ITEMS 16 AND 17 ON THE AGENDA WERE CONSIDERED BY THE GOVERNING COUNCIL *IN CAMERA*.

## **1. Chair's Remarks**

The Chair welcomed members and guests to the meeting. She thanked Professor Scott Mabury for leading the pre-meeting tour of the *ONRamp* facility at the Banting Institute. She also thanked the Office of the Vice-President of Research and Innovation as well as the Office of University of Toronto Entrepreneurship for coordinating the tour.

The Chair acknowledged the recent acquisition of the four-acre site bordered by College Street and Spadina Avenue that was currently home to the Centre for Addiction and Mental Health. She congratulated President Gertler, Professor Mabury and those involved in the acquisition and also thanked the Chair of the Business Board, Keith Thomas, and Business Board members for their careful consideration of the matter during the summer months.

Finally, the Chair congratulated teaching staff governor, Professor Mark Lautens, who received two recent honours: The Henry Marshall Tory Medal for outstanding research in any branch of astronomy, chemistry, mathematics, physics, or an allied science, and the School of Graduate Studies JJ Berry Smith Doctoral Supervision Award, which recognized outstanding performance in the multiple roles associated with doctoral supervision.

## **2. Report of the President**

The Chair invited the President to make his Report.

Before commencing his Report, the President invited representatives from aUToronto, the University's team competing in the SAE/GM Autodrive Challenge, to offer a presentation. Mr. Keenan Burnett, the aUToronto team lead, outlined the Autodrive challenge and the ways in which aUToronto was preparing for the competition. He described progress to date and acknowledged the assistance of various sponsors. He also acknowledged the entire aUToronto team, including the Principal Faculty Advisor, Professor Angela Schoellig. Professor Schoellig took a moment to praise the commitment, intelligence, and work ethic of the team and attributed the team's success so far to the students' efforts.

The President commended the aUToronto team and wished them luck in the Autodrive Challenge.

### Discussion of the Naylor Report

President Gertler recalled that in April 2017, an expert panel chaired by Professor David Naylor, President Emeritus of the University of Toronto, had submitted its report – *Investing in Canada’s Future – Strengthening the Foundations of Canadian Research* – to the Federal government. In response to some of the recommendations made in the Naylor Report, the Minister of Science, the Hon. Kirsty Duncan, had announced several structural and organizational changes intended to improve governance and coordination among the Federal funding agencies. These included the launch of an Advisory Council on Science and Innovation, plans to create a coordinating board for granting councils as well as a commitment to work with the Minister of Health, the Honourable Ginette Petitpas Taylor, to amend the Canadian Institutes of Health Research Act to separate the agency’s CEO and Board Chair functions. The President noted that these were positive and welcome changes. He emphasized that more needed to be done, and that the Government had not yet decided on critically important new investments.

President Gertler stated that the University would continue to collaborate with Universities Canada and the U15 Group of Canadian Research Universities to formulate a multi-dimensional advocacy strategy that would push for the adoption of the Naylor Report recommendations. A goal of these efforts would be to highlight to the government and to the public, the impact of research on the quality of life in Canada and beyond. A media campaign would be launched to present these ideas broadly.

President Gertler reported that in September 2017, he had met with the *Toronto Star* editorial board. This had resulted in a *Star* editorial articulating the need for higher levels of federal support for research. In addition, President Gertler, with his counterparts from McGill University and the University of British Columbia (UBC), had also co-authored a *Globe and Mail* op-ed, highlighting the importance of investigator-driven research for innovation.

Some other advocacy strategies would include the launch of a broader initiative with UBC, McGill University, the University of Calgary, and Dalhousie University to enlist community leaders, alumni and others as third-party champions to seek support for the Naylor Report. Advocacy efforts would continue and intensify throughout the year in the run up to the Federal government’s 2018 budget.

### Update on the Strategic Mandate Agreement II

President Gertler noted that the Strategic Mandate Agreement I (SMA I) was drawing to a close. The University’s SMA II had been finalized with the Provincial government. A complete account of the Agreement’s details would have to wait for the full release of all SMA II agreements that was expected to occur in the coming weeks. The President noted that SMA II continued to advance the Provincial government’s differentiation agenda, encouraging distinctive institutional goals. For the University of Toronto, this included more flexibility in recruiting international PhD students as well as continued growth of domestic graduate student enrolment. The administration had worked with officials of the Ministry of Advanced Education and Skills Development (MAESD) to articulate the

University of Toronto's unique advantages and ensure that these were reflected in the SMA II document.

### City Building

President Gertler reported that on October 2, 2017, the University had signed the first formal Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with the City of Toronto. Under the MoU, the University and the City would collaborate on the following initiatives, among others, in the coming year:

- Improving on transportation systems
- Enhancing food security
- Designating Toronto as a UNESCO Creative Capital city, and
- Assisting the City in meeting its greenhouse gas reduction goals in line with the Paris Climate Accord.

President Gertler expressed hope that the MoU would herald a new era of cooperation with the City to make Toronto a better place in which to live, work and study.

### University Rankings

President Gertler called the members' attention to the University's current rankings. He highlighted the following statistics about the University's rankings:

- #1 in Canada on every major international ranking
- Consistently ranked among the world's top 25 on most rankings and as high as #4
- Ranked among the top 10 public universities globally
- Ranked very high in several subject-matter ranking: Law (10<sup>th</sup>), Education (11<sup>th</sup>) and Arts and Humanities (15<sup>th</sup>).

On Employability rankings, the University continued to excel:

- *Times Higher Education*: 14th overall; 6th among public institutions globally, and the top public institution in North America.
- *QS World University Rankings*: 15<sup>th</sup> overall and 3<sup>rd</sup> among public institutions in North America.

President Gertler concluded his remarks on rankings by noting that U of T's rankings had remained remarkably consistent over time and across different ranking agencies. He also noted that global competition was getting more intense, with universities in several jurisdictions rising in the rankings. U of T could not be complacent and must continue to strive towards excellence.

The Chair thanked the President for his Report.

### **3. Presentation: Vector Institute**

University Professor Emeritus Geoffrey Hinton delivered a presentation, appended [here](#), which began by explaining the long-standing debate within the artificial intelligence (AI) community

concerning the most appropriate approach to AI. On the one hand, proponents of the logic-inspired approach argued that the essence of intelligence was using symbolic rules to manipulate symbolic expressions. The biologically-inspired approach, on the other hand, posited that the essence of intelligence was learning the strengths of the connections in a neural network. With the aide of recent historical data, Professor Hinton suggested that it would be the increased understanding of neural networks that would be the future of AI.

His presentation then explained the structure of a neural network and how to efficiently train and manipulate neural networks using a technique known as “back-propagation”. Finally, he outlined some notable contributions made by Canada related to developments in AI to date and described some advance within the field of AI that were likely in the near future.

Members asked questions on various topics, including future developments of AI within industry, particularly within the healthcare industry, and ways to increase student participation and interest in AI-related programs. In reply to the first question, Professor Hinton replied that, through the use of neural networks, the impact of AI across various sectors would be significant. Since they were capable of increasingly complex analytical thought and were able to analogize, neural networks would likely have significant impacts on drug design and patient therapy, machine translation, data collection and storage, computer vision and natural language processing, among other areas.

Turning to student participation in AI, Professor Hinton stressed the need for increased student involvement in the field of AI, including the deep learning of neural networks. This was necessary not only to meet current demand for AI related jobs within industry, but also to have a broader pool of future instructors with the necessary training and experience. Dean Cristina Amon noted that there were several recent initiatives within the Faculty of Applied Science and Engineering, including the creation of a new major in machine learning and increased course offerings in the fields of analytics, machine learning and deep learning for students pursuing a Masters of Engineering.

The Chair thanked Professor Hinton for his presentation.

#### ***4. Report of the University Ombudsperson for the Period July 1, 2016 to June 30, 2017 and Administrative Response***

The Chair welcomed Professor Emeritus Ellen Hodnett, University Ombudsperson, to present her report. The Chair reminded Governors that the University Ombudsperson was responsible to the Governing Council, through its Chair.

Professor Hodnett began her report by noting that no new systemic issues had been identified and that there were no instances where policies needed to be developed or reviewed. She then highlighted two areas of concern from her report. The first focussed on low engagement with the Office of the Ombudsperson in general, and from the University of Toronto Mississauga and University of Toronto Scarborough in particular. This was despite various outreach efforts, including “Just in Time” slides and the offer of Skype meetings. A review committee had been struck and part of its mandate would be to examine increasing the accessing of services, including from UTM and UTSC.

The second concern Professor Hodnett highlighted also related to contact with the Office of the Ombudsperson, but focussed on the increase in miscellaneous complaints received by the Office

from the public. Approximately one hundred such complaints had been received by her office since September, 2017. It was recommended that options for reducing these complaints would be examined.

The Chair invited Professor Regehr to make comments. She began by thanking the Ombudsperson for her service, her annual report, and her focus on the tri-campus role. Professor Regehr then highlighted two of the areas that the University had already been engaged in, coming from recommendations from previous reports: the *University Mandated Leave of Absence Policy* and progress on the working group to examine accommodations within “lock-step programs”.

Members asked questions relating to possible options for increasing engagement with the Office of the Ombudsperson from UTM and UTSC as well as concerns relating to the *University Mandated Leave of Absence Policy* and whether this *Policy* would apply to students seeking accommodation within “lock-step” programs. In reply to the first question, Professor Hodnett indicated that various initiatives were being considered, including the possibility of having part-time Ombuds officers on each of the three campuses, who would have a greater understanding of the distinct social mores on each campus. In reply to the second question, Professor Regehr noted that the *Policy* was currently in draft form and consultations with various stakeholder were underway. She also explained that students in “lock-step” programs who may require accommodation, and those students potentially affected by the *Policy*, were separate and distinct.

The Chair thanked the Ombudsperson for her Report.

## **5. Item for Governing Council Approval**

### **a. Capital Project: W.G. Davis Building Renovation – Phase 2 (Meeting Place)**

Professor Uli Krull noted that the W.G. Davis Building Renovation was much needed, as the current space was not meeting the needs of students. He noted the importance of the space as the “front-door” of the campus and explained that the current project was Phase 2 of what would be a three-phase project.

In reply to a question submitted in advance, Professor Mabury explained that there would be a 50% increase in bicycle parking in front of the building.

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

#### **IT WAS RESOLVED**

THAT the Project Planning Committee Report for the W.G. Davis Building Renovation – Phase 2 (Meeting Place) at the University of Toronto Mississauga dated August 25, 2017, be approved in principle; and

THAT the project scope for the W.G. Davis Building Renovation – Phase 2 (Meeting Place) totaling 2,490 net assignable square metres (nasm) or 3,618 gross square metres (gsm) be approved in principle, to be funded by UTM Capital Reserves derived from Operating and the Food Services Ancillary.

## **CONSENT AGENDA**

On a motion duly made, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED THAT

The consent agenda be adopted and items on it approved.

### **6. Renewal and proposed revisions of “Community Affiliated Hospital” Template Agreement**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

- (a) THAT the revised template for community hospital affiliation agreements between the University of Toronto and the community hospitals be approved, effective immediately; and
- (b) THAT the President, or designate, be authorized to sign such agreements on behalf of the Governing Council, provided that the agreements conform to the approved template; and
- (c) THAT the agreements signed under the provisions of this resolution be filed with the Secretary of Governing Council.

### **7. Renewal and proposed revisions of “Non-Hospital Clinical Affiliation” Template Agreement**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

- (a) THAT the revised template for non-hospital clinical site affiliation agreements between the University of Toronto and the non-hospital clinical site be approved, effective immediately;
- (b) THAT the President, or designate, be authorized to sign such agreements on behalf of the Governing Council, provided that the agreements conform to the approved template; and
- (c) THAT the agreements signed under the provisions of this resolution be filed with the Secretary of Governing Council.

**8. Revisions to Terms of Reference of the Academic Board**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the proposed revised Academic Board *Terms of Reference* be approved, effective immediately, replacing the Terms of Reference previously approved on October 30, 2013.

**9. Amendments to the *Policy with Respect to Workplace Harassment and the Policy with Respect to Workplace Violence***

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the amendments to the *Policy with respect to Workplace Harassment* (dated May 13, 2010 and amended September 8, 2016) and *Policy with Respect to Workplace Violence* (dated May 13, 2010) be approved, effective immediately.

**10. Report of the Previous Meeting of the Governing Council**

The minutes of the September 6, 2017 meeting were approved.

**11. Business Arising from the Previous Meeting**

There was no business arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

**12. Reports for Information**

Members received the following reports for information:

- a. Report Number 26 of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council (October 3, 2017)
- b. Report Number 25 of the University of Toronto Mississauga Campus Council (October 4, 2017)
- c. Report 211 of the Academic Board (October 5, 2017)
- d. Report 202 of the University Affairs Board (October 2, 2017)
- e. Report 235 of the Business Board (October 10, 2017)
- f. Report Number 492 of the Executive Committee (October 12, 2017)

**END OF CONSENT AGENDA**

**13. Date of Next Meeting**

The Chair advised members that the next Governing Council meeting was scheduled for Thursday, December 14, 2017 at 4:30 p.m.

**14. Question Period**

There were no questions.

**15. Other Business**

The Governing Council moved *In Camera*.

**16. Capital Project: W.G. David Building Renovation – Phase 2 (Meeting Place) – Total Project Cost and Sources of Funding**

On motion duly made, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the recommendations concerning Total Project Cost and Sources of Funding for the W.G. David Building Renovation – Phase 2 (Meeting Place), as outlined in the memorandum from Professor Scott Mabury, dated October 19, 2017, be approved.

**17. Report Number 61 of the Committee for Honorary Degrees**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the recommendations contained in Report Number 60 of the Committee for Honorary Degrees be approved: and

THAT the Chancellor and the President be empowered to determine the degree to be conferred on each candidate and the date of the conferral.

The meeting adjourned at 6:25 p.m.

---

Secretary

---

Chair

October 27, 2017